

MINUTES
CITY COMMISSION MEETING
September 9, 2013

The City Commission met this date in regular session in the Commission Chambers. The Invocation was given by Comm. Hamilton, after which the Pledge of Allegiance was recited. A quorum being present, the meeting was called to order at 6:00 PM with the following in attendance.

Mayor	:	John B. Arnold, Jr.
Commissioners	:	Heyward H. Strong, Jr.
	:	Diane Kelley
	:	Kay Hamilton
	:	Joe Morgan
City Clerk	:	Tammy Johnson
City Administrator	:	Carl Scott
Police Chief	:	Joe Hart
Fire Chief	:	Mark Norris
Library Director	:	David Weatherford
City Attorney	:	Hayward Dykes
Recorder	:	Beth Millsaps

Others in attendance: (Not inclusive) Kay Rasmussen, Ed Milton, Jim Bateman, Thomas G. Miller, Diane Miller, Elizabeth Berrill, Eric Berrill, Renee Ponce, Joey Ponce, Marion Cassell, Don Caverly, Tyler Griswold, Gene Dylewski, Nathan Sparks

Mayor Arnold welcomed all in attendance and instructed should anyone wish to speak, come to the podium and state your name and address.

Welcome
by the
Mayor

1. CITIZENS' CONCERNS (non agenda items) – Resident

Citizens'
Concerns
Resident

Geno Dylewski, 198 Highland, and his neighbor Tyler Griswold from 193 Highland, Mr. Dylewski said he was presenting on behalf of Tyler and other citizens in regards to the lawsuit regarding Dr. Michael Harris. Mayor Arnold requested Mr. Dylewski be brief and that due to the pending lawsuit what could be discussed was limited and if he would like he could contact our attorney on the matter Mr. Bruce Bowman. Mr. Dylewski said he was unable to bring Mary at 205 Highland to discuss the 14' fence that Dr. Harris has around his property, he thought fences were to be limited to 8' to 10' not 14'. Mayor Arnold suggested that Mr. Dylewski come back to the next meeting to discuss once we have had time to look into the matter, he doesn't guarantee we will have the answers but we can look into the situation. Mrs. Johnson suggested to Mr. Dylewski if he would like to be on the agenda for the next meeting there is a form that he can complete, she said she would need the form back to her the Wednesday before the next regular meeting so she can have it in the with Commission packets.

2. CITIZENS' CONCERNS (non agenda items) – Non Resident

Citizens'
Concerns
Non
Resident

There were no non-resident comments.

1. NEW AGENDA ITEMS – Added Agenda Items

Added
Agenda
Items

Mayor Arnold said that we had an application to appoint a new member to the Planning Commission and requested that be placed on the agenda for tonight. COMM. MORGAN MADE A MOTION THAT THE APPLICATION FOR PLANNING COMMISSION MEMBER BE ADDED TO TONIGHT'S AGENDA. COMM. KELLEY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH PASSED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE COMMISSION 5 TO 0.

Mayor Arnold said we would also have to have a fair housing workshop after our CDBG hearing, Mr. Scott said this is a requirement as part of the grant process. COMM. MORGAN MADE A MOTION TO ADD THE WORKSHOP TO THIS EVENING'S AGENDA. COMM. KELLEY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH PASSED BY UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE COMMISSION 5 TO 0.

2. NEW AGENDA ITEMS – Introduction EDC Executive Director Nathan Sparks

Introductio
n EDC
Executive
Director
Nathan
Sparks

Mr. Sparks introduced himself and said that he looks forward to working with the city. He said he was lucky that the EDC already had such a capable staff in place led by Ms. Kay Rasmussen. He said that the EDC will continue to work with the cities to bring jobs to the area and looks forward to getting things underway. Mayor Arnold said he has the utmost confidence in the EDC and Ms. Rasmussen.

3. NEW AGENDA ITEMS – CDBG Public Hearing

CDBG
Public
Hearing

Lindsay Denmark with Jordan and Associates said that she had met with the Visioning Committee earlier, that they are acting as our CATF on this project and they have suggested the neighborhood revitalization as a priority for the city. She said the city is eligible for a \$700,000 grant from CDBG. She said there are four categories eligible for CDBG funding. The Housing category is to improve housing conditions and to expand housing communities for moderate to low and very low income families. She said that category is to rehabilitate housing to code it will demolish dilapidated houses and provide for relocation. Ms. Denmark said that the Neighborhood Revitalization category that the Visioning Committee has suggested as a priority will provide for infrastructure improvements and also utility and drainage, paving, sidewalks, lighting, fire protection, removal of architectural barriers and numerous other neighborhood and community development/improvement projects to prevent continuing deterioration, crime, health and safety problems. She said one of the priorities is sewer system upgrades and that will be covered under Neighborhood Revitalization. Ms. Denmark said there is also Commercial

Revitalization category which is funding for improvement of downtown commercial districts including storefront improvements, utility line replacement, parking, curbing and litter receptacles to promote business activity. She said there is also an Economic Development category, she said this is a 50/50 public and private investment development project designed to generate business activity through the creation of new jobs to Florida. Ms. Denmark said there is approximately \$21,528,569 for the four categories with Neighborhood Revitalization receiving the largest percentage of funds so it would be a good idea to put in a grant application for this category. She said in order to apply for the grant, the City must be able to provide documentation showing that at least 51% of the residents who will benefit are within the income guidelines set by the Department of Housing and Urban Development. She said the dates of application aren't firmly set at this time but generally the opening to apply for a grant would be January with a closing around the end of February or first part of March. Ms. Denmark said as part of the applications process there would be a survey sent out to every residence asking for income verification, she said those would be collected by Mr. Scott and after the collection if we haven't received the 51% participation needed representatives from Jordan and Associates would go door to door to the residents that haven't returned the survey or contact the residents by phone. Mayor Arnold said at this time Jordan and Associates would be gathering the information needed to submit for the application for the grant.

Mr. Don Caverly, 113 Choctaw Cove, asked if due to the F35 program and the noise associated with it would there be something that could be done to help those in the most affected areas. Ms. Denmark said she heard from the Visioning Committee earlier today about this situation and would have to do research as to what might be done for that area and get back in touch with Mr. Scott, it wasn't anything that she had faced before. Mayor Arnold said in the actual clear zone he believes the federal government is required to buy those houses once they have Congressional approval to do so, which may take years before that occurs. COMM. STRONG MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE VISIONING COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION TO APPLY FOR THE NEIGHBORHOOD REVITALIZATION AS A PRIORITY FOR THE CDBG GRANT APPLICATION. MAYOR ARNOLD SECONDED THE MOTION, MOTION VOTED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR OF THE MOTION 5 TO 0. Mayor Arnold tentatively adjourn the meeting in order to go into the Fair Housing Workshop.

Fair
Housing
Workshop

3. NEW AGENDA ITEMS – Fair Housing Workshop

Ms. Denmark said Title VIII of the Civil Rights Act of 1968 (Fair Housing Act), as amended, prohibits discrimination in the sale, rental, and financing of dwellings, and in other housing-related transactions, based on race, color, national origin, religion, gender, familial status, and handicap. She said examples within these protected groups include: African Americans, Alaskan Natives, American Indians, Asians, Pacific Islanders, Hasidic Jews, Groups distinguished by age, persons with disabilities and women. The City of Valparaiso has adopted a fair housing policy in order to insure protection of these groups. She said the city has passed a fair housing ordinance, which includes provisions for citizens' complaints if they feel they have been discriminated against. Ms. Denmark said she has also dropped off Fair Housing pamphlets at city hall that have the phone number directly to the HUD office if needed to file a complaint. Ms. Denmark has a form that needs to be signed for those in the audience saying that they have attended the fair housing workshop. Mrs. Johnson said the advertisement in the paper was that for the fair housing workshop? Ms. Denmark said she believed it covered the public hearing and also the fair housing workshop, the legal advertisement is also a requirement of the grant process. Mayor Arnold said the legal advertisement appeared in the Northwest Florida Daily News on August 29, 2013 for the hearing. Mayor Arnold said we would now recess this workshop and go back into our regular scheduled meeting.

Resolution
No.
07-09-09-
13

4. NEW AGENDA ITEMS – Resolution No. 07-09-09-13

Mayor Arnold read Resolution No. 07-09-09-13 a resolution to amend the monthly service rates for commercial sanitation customers and provide an effective date. Comm. Hamilton said that Mr. Valandingham was to speak on this matter, Mrs. Johnson said that Mr. Valandingham is not well and he has been in the field most of the day. Mrs. Johnson said she could speak on behalf of this matter as she and Mr. Valandingham had discussed the situation. Mrs. Johnson said the city has purchased carts for sanitation and that the businesses were using them now and we were looking for a better way to do the fee schedule, previously we had business separated into different categories and assigned a certain amount, with this resolution the business will be charged by the number of carts they have. She said also we have in the resolution that if a business customer chooses not to use our service that business will be charged \$29.56 monthly. Mayor Arnold asked what percentage of an increase will this be. Mrs. Johnson said it really isn't an increase, with some businesses it was actually a little lower than what they are presently paying or staying the same. Mrs. Johnson said she believed that Mr. Valandingham had spoken to all the local businesses about the change to make everyone aware of the proposed change. Comm. Strong said so basically this will be a wash. Mrs. Johnson agreed. Comm. Morgan asked if we had always charged businesses that have not used our service. Mayor Arnold said yes and it has been approximately the same amount as it is in this resolution. COMM. HAMILTON MADE A MOTION TO PASS RESOLUTION NO. 07-09-09-13 AS WRITTEN. COMM. STRONG SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH PASSED WITH A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE COMMISSION 5 TO 0. Comm. Hamilton said she would also like to remind everyone this rate change affects only the businesses not residential addresses.

5. NEW AGENDA ITEMS – New Sanitation Truck

Sanitation
Truck

Comm. Hamilton said this is not for this year. Mayor Arnold said if we put in our order this year then we can save \$4,000 but it would be paid for out of 2014, out of the reserve fund. Mrs. Johnson said there would also be a three month delay on delivery if we waited and didn't sign a letter of intent to purchase. Mrs. Johnson said what Mr. Valandingham is wanting to do is put in a letter of intent to order the truck, she said the money isn't going to come out of this year's budget but 2014 reserve fund. COMM. HAMILTON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE LETTER OF INTENT TO PURCHASE A NEW SANITATION TRUCK, Comm. Morgan asked if this would be binding letter? Comm. Hamilton said yes it would be. COMM. STRONG SECONDED THE MOTION. Comm. Morgan asked for Mr. Dykes' opinion regarding this letter. Mr. Dykes said he would recommend if we do the letter of intent to place a caveat that it is subject to budget approval by the Commission. Comm. Hamilton said the letter needed to be in before the end of this month, the end of the fiscal year, it needs to be done as soon as possible, yesterday. Mr. Dykes said assuming that is the case in order to reserve any right or limit potential liability if they will allow you to draft a letter of intent in such a manner that it is contingent upon. Comm. Hamilton asked if that would be necessary because she believes the company has submitted a letter to be signed. Mr. Dykes said he could look at the letter but if it is a letter of intent they would rely on that. Comm. Morgan said he didn't want to put us in a legal bind, why didn't we amend the motion so that Mr. Dykes could review the letter. Comm. Hamilton said ok we could amend it to Mr. Dykes' review not changing anything. COMM. HAMILTON MADE AN AMENDMENT TO HER PREVIOUS MOTION THAT THE LETTER OF INTENT BE SIGNED AFTER MR. DYKES' REVIEW, COMM. STRONG SECONDED THE AMENDED MOTION. AMENDMENT PASSED WITH A 5 TO 0 UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE COMMISSION, THE BASIC MOTION TO PURCHASE THE SANITATION TRUCK, the open motion on the floor, WHICH PASSED BY UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE COMMISSION 5 TO 0.

6. NEW AGENDA ITEMS – Health Insurance for Employee's Family

Health
Insurance
For
Employee's
Family

Mayor Arnold said he had asked Mrs. Johnson to look into what other cities pay for health care for employee's families, we currently pay 50% of family coverage and with the continued raise in health care cost he thought it would be a good idea to see what other communities are doing. He said if we did enact anything it would be for future employees and to protect our current people. Mrs. Johnson comprised a chart comparing Valparaiso with the cities of Destin, Niceville, Crestview, Mary Esther, and Ft. Walton Beach. Mayor Arnold said looking at these comparisons we actually pay the least. Comm. Morgan said it looked as if Crestview was paying the same as we are. Mayor Arnold said he didn't need anything that would require action this evening.

7. NEW AGENDA ITEMS – Interlocal Agreement Local Option Gas Tax Revenues

Interlocal
Agreement
Gas Tax
Revenue

Mayor Arnold said that Comm. Strong had been in several meetings regarding this issue, Comm. Strong said he feels we started too late on this issue and he recommends that we sign this document because time is running out however he would like the minutes to reflect a statement. Comm. Strong said the minutes should reflect a caveat not to be included in the Interlocal Agreement stating "the City of Valparaiso believes the state default formula should have been utilized as written in statute to reflect a 61/39 split of local gas tax revenues between the county and the municipalities." Mayor Arnold said this agreement was for 64% to go to the county with 36% going to the cities, of that we get 2.6787%, we will see a slight increase from the 3¢ tax in funds this year. Comm. Strong said that is what is reflected in the budget. COMM. STRONG MADE A MOTION TO SIGN THE INTERLOCAL AGREEMENT AMONG OKALOOSA COUNTY AND THE MUNICIPALITIES OF CINCO BAYOU, CRESTVIEW, DESTIN, FT. WALTON BEACH, LAUREL HILL, MARY ESTHER, NICEVILLE, SHALIMAR AND VALPARAISO FOR THE DISTRIBUTION OF THE LOCAL OPTION GAS TAX REVENUES FOR THE NEXT TEN YEARS. Comm. Strong said we do have a caveat to look into opening it up and we will look into doing that next year and we will have more time to do that. Mayor Arnold said previously it was a 60% county and 40% city split. COMM. HAMILTON SECONDED THE MOTION, MOTION PASSED BY UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE COMMISSION 5 TO 0.

Planning
Comm.
Appointment

8. ADDED AGENDA ITEM – Planning Commission Member Appointment

Mayor Arnold said we would now discuss adding Mr. Eric Berrill to the Planning Commission, he is in attendance this evening. He said Mr. Berrill submitted an application to be appointed to the Planning Commission and his qualifications are in the Commission packet. COMM. HAMILTON MADE A MOTION TO APPOINT MR. ERIC BERRILL TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION TO BEGIN IMMEDIATELY. COMM. STRONG SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH PASSED BY UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE COMMISSION 5 TO 0. Mayor Arnold welcomed Mr. Berrill to the Planning Commission.

Proclamation
Constitution
Week

9. NEW AGENDA ITEMS – Proclamation Constitution Week

Mayor Arnold read the proclamation supporting Constitution week and proclaiming the week of September 17 to September 23 to be Constitution Week. COMM. STRONG MADE A MOTION TO ADOPT SEPTEMBER 17 TO SEPTEMBER 23, 2013 AS CONSTITUTION WEEK. COMM. HAMILTON SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH PASSED BY UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE COMMISSION 5 TO 0. Comm. Morgan said he thought it

would also be a good idea to put the dates on our marquee sign and also add a link on our website to the constitution.

Revised
Charter

1. OLD BUSINESS – Revised Charter

Mayor Arnold said he believed everyone had received copies of what we had at this point, he had hoped we would have a clean copy but at this time we are not there. Mayor Arnold said he would like the Commissioners to go through what had been given to them and if they had any other information to get that to Mrs. Johnson before September 16th, so that Mr. Dykes will have time to prepare everything for a final document. Mayor Arnold said he would like to have a final review on September 23rd, the night of the final budget hearing. Mr. Thomas Miller, 202 Hickory Lane, said he had some concern regarding updating the charter, he felt like 10 years ago this had been looked at and brought up to date and there wasn't any mention of an administrative assistant, now known as the city administrator. He said in the interim things have changed. Mr. Miller said he thinks the only reason this is being revised is to change the administrator to the manager, he said that at a previous meeting the "city manager" was taken out of the revision but now with the responsibilities being placed with the city administrator he will become the "city manager" by defacto, in other words if he has all the duties then he has the responsibilities. Mr. Miller said it takes away all the responsibilities from the Commission and Mayor and the administrator is free to hire and fire all other staff members. He said there are plenty of people willing to run for Commission and Mayor and that he feels this is all a charade to push one person's position. Mayor Arnold asked that all inputs be given to Mrs. Johnson by September 16th so that any changes could be given to Mr. Dykes in time to take action on the September 23rd meeting.

TPO/DOT

1. REPORTS/CORRESPONDENCE/ANNOUCEMENTS – TPO/DOT

Comm. Morgan said the meeting was held at our office and there was a discussion of priorities, he said approved a membership for the county that reduces the county numbers but increases the city participation so that higher proportion of cities are being represented to including growing areas in Freeport and Crestview.

Stormwater

2. REPORTS/CORRESPONDENCE/ANNOUCEMENTS – Stormwater

Mr. Scott said they didn't have any reports of stormwater problems. Mayor Arnold said this maybe one thing we need to address in our CBDG grant, it is a very important item, and it will have more oversight in years to come with the county and state. Comm. Morgan said he would also like it noted that we are looking at West Bayshore Drive and its concurrent issues with stormwater runoff and traffic ability how it meets with John Sims Parkway, with its ease of traffic flow etc.

Legal
Activities

3. REPORTS/CORRESPONDENCE/ANNOUCEMENTS – Legal Activities

Mr. Dykes said as indicated in the public comment we do have a lawsuit pending in Okaloosa County we have contacted to Florida League of Cities and they will be providing legal defense, they are reserving their rights to evaluate their claim towards its end to see if any type of judgment, the good news at this point they are going to provide the city with a defense. Mr. Dykes said there are 7 or 8 allegations pending with this lawsuit that revolves around whether or not the city owns property along Tom's Bayou, a strip of land behind where the Compass Rose and other properties are located. Mr. Dykes said without getting into too much detail, they are seeking a declaratory judgment, quiet title action, trespass and various other claims, he anticipates as things move along some of the claims will be dropped. For the publics knowledge and as the Commission well knows we won't get into details at a public meeting regarding pending litigation pursuant to state statute we are allowed to do that type discussion on a limited basis related to litigation expenditures and settlement negotiations in an executive session. Mayor Arnold said he just wanted to get out the gist of the information for the public so they know what is going on. Mr. Dykes said on the Willingham case it is still pending in federal court, it was set for trial but the firm on behalf of the city filed a motion for summary judgment, there was a change with the judges, the new judge came in and cancelled the trial. He said we are waiting on the ruling for the pending motion, he said the idea is that the courts will rule on pending litigation. Mr. Dykes said on the Sundstrom, Wyckoff case everything is still being researched.

City Park
Update

4. REPORTS/CORRESPONDENCE/ANNOUCEMENTS – City Park Update

Comm. Kelley said that Mr. Valandingham has advised her that in Lincoln Park where the water was puddling around the flag pole he has removed the asphalt and prepared the area for sod and installed bollards around the area. Comm. Kelley said in Echo Park, the dog park, the interior fence gate has come off and it has been pulled to be repaired. Comm. Kelley said also in an email Mr. Valandingham had related to her that a citizen had reported a tree in dangerous condition at Florida Park and it had been removed.

Planning
Comm.

5. REPORTS/CORRESPONDENCE/ANNOUCEMENTS – Planning Commission

Chair Browning said he would like to welcome their new member Mr. Eric Berrill, nothing further to report.

Median
Beauti-
fication
Update

6. REPORTS/CORRESPONDENCE/ANNOUCEMENTS – Median Beautification Update

Comm. Morgan said they had nothing new to report.

Visioning
Comm.

7. REPORTS/CORRESPONDENCE/ANNOUCEMENTS – Visioning Committee Update

Mr. Joe Cobb, Quail Trail and member of the committee, said that the committee

is still very much a work in progress, working on coming up with ideas that are feasible and fundable. Mr. Cobb said they have discussed numerous ideas, spiffing up John Sims downtown area also trying to attract small businesses into vacant business areas. Mayor Arnold said he would like to meet with the committee and discuss some possible ideas. Comm. Morgan said unfortunately the ideas Mr. Cobb has mentioned would fall under commercial revitalization and the approval for earlier in the evening was to apply for neighborhood revitalization and he asked why the Visioning Committee would have gone toward the neighborhood instead of commercial. Mr. Cobb said they had discussed some rundown areas, for lack of a better word, and it would be difficult to spruce things up without a grant of some sort. Mayor Arnold said he didn't think the committee should limit themselves based on economics, when they came up with some good ideas and direction it should be up to the Commission to find resources they shouldn't spend a lot of time on that. Mr. Cobb said the shift tonight from commercial to neighborhood is because the highest percentage of funds falls in the neighborhood revitalization for community block grants, or best chance to be funded is with the neighborhood improvement projects. Mr. Scott said the CDBG is for low to moderate income, we wouldn't be able to get a grant for John Sims Parkway as far as commercial revitalization in low to moderate income unless it was a really large job creator, no way we would have qualified there. Comm. Morgan said that is why he was asking as long as we are pursuing where the needs and funding are.

8. **REPORTS/CORRESPONDENCE/ANNOUNCEMENTS – Budget Hearings** Budget Hearings
 Mayor Arnold said we would have our first public hearing on the budget tomorrow evening September 10th at 6 PM with the second and final hearing on September 23rd at 6 PM. He said there are no additional rates for utilities and the recommend millage rate has stayed the same.
9. **REPORTS/CORRESPONDENCE/ANNOUNCEMENTS – Etc.** Etc.
 Mayor Arnold said that Mr. Timothy Bridges had called city hall, he is Air Force Secretary of Installations and Environment and he would be calling tomorrow at 11 am to speak with the Mayor, concerning our mutual concerns between the Air Force and the city. He said at this time that is all he knows. Comm. Strong said he is the person who will be making the decision. Mayor Arnold said Mr. Bridges would be the person to sign off on the ROD, record of decision, once public hearings were complete.
10. **REPORTS/CORRESPONDENCE/ANNOUNCEMENTS – Open House** Etc. Open House
 Chief Norris said he would like to invite everyone to the fire department's open house on October 5th from 9 am to 3 pm; also the second week of October is fire prevention week.
1. **ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS – Minutes**
 COMM. HAMILTON MADE A MOTION THAT THE MINUTES OF AUGUST 5, 2013 BE APPROVED AS WRITTEN. COMM. KELLEY SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH PASSED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE COMMISSION 5 TO 0. Minutes August 5, 2013
 COMM. STRONG MADE A MOTION THAT THE MINUTES OF AUGUST 12, 2013 BE APPROVED AS WRITTEN. COMM. MORGAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH PASSED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE COMMISSION 5 TO 0. August 12, 2013
 Comm. Strong said on page 1, line 25 to remove "he said total income from our 1 cent gas tax" and just change the "they" on line 36 to Okaloosa County Commission. Comm. Morgan said on page 8 line 4 instead of "differed" it should be "deferred" and on line 6 there should be a comma after impact. COMM. STRONG MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FROM AUGUST 26, 2013 AFTER CORRECTIONS ARE MADE. COMM. MORGAN SECONDED THE MOTION WHICH PASSED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF THE COMMISSION 5 TO 0.
2. **ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS – Bills Payable** Bills Payable
 COMM. STRONG MADE A MOTION TO PAY THE REGULAR BILLS AND VCA BILLS AS OUTLINED IN THE FINANCIAL STATEMENT(S). COMM. MORGAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH PASS UNANIMOUSLY WITH A 5 TO 0 VOTE OF COMMISSION.
- ADJOURN** Adjourn
 There being no further business to be brought before the Commission, the meeting adjourned at 7:15 PM.

John B. Arnold, Jr.
 Mayor

Heyward H. Strong, Jr.
 Chair, VCA

ATTEST:

Tammy Johnson, CMC

City Clerk

September 9, 2013

The DVD labeled September 9, 2013 contains the audio and video of this meeting and will be kept as a permanent part of these minutes.